

Author's Name/Student ID: _____ Reviewer's Name/Student ID: _____

2nd Peer Review

Thesis: A good thesis not only states the argument of the paper, but also explains how the argument will be made. Mark the thesis statement, or what you think the thesis statement is, in the paper. Does the paper have a **clear**, well-developed **[Sufficiency]** thesis? If not, what's missing? Does this thesis have the four characteristics of a strong thesis statement? If not, what's lacking?

Evidence [Information]: Is there **sufficient** evidence to support the thesis? If so, what is the strength of the evidence? If not, where does it seem to be lacking?

Analysis: Analysis can be understood as the interpretive step between evidence **[Information]** and argument **[Inferences]**. Does this paper have strong analysis, or does it tend to simply posit evidence, hoping that the reader will interpret its **significance**? Are there places where the author needs to elaborate **[Sufficiency]** on the connections between his/her evidence and argument? If so, where?

Text in Red

Indicates the infusion of the
Elements of Reasoning

Text in Blue

Indicates the infusion of the
Intellectual Standards

Text in Green

Indicates the infusion of the
Intellectual Traits

[Bracketed Text]

Indicates the indirect use of
critical thinking **[Elements]**,
[Standards], or **[Traits]**

[View more about the Paul-Elder
Framework of Critical Thinking](#)

Organization: Does the paper have a **clear, logical** organization? Is it explained/made explicit why it is organized in this manner? On the paragraph level, are there strong topic sentences and transitions?

Documentation: Does the paper include **at least 3 peer-reviewed publications**? Does the paper properly document its sources? Were there any places in the paper where you felt like it was **unclear** where the information was coming from/i.e. needed better documentation?

Course content: How well does the paper address themes from the class? Has the author referenced **relevant** materials from the course? Can you think of things we have discussed in class that might be useful to include here? What? Why?